CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF NOVEMBER 8, 2007

202 C Street, City Administration Building

Council Committee Room, 12th Floor San Diego, CA

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Otto Emme at 9:02 a.m.

Chairperson	Otto Emme	Present
Vice Chairperson	Jerry Schaefer	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Laura Burnett	Absent
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Absent
Boardmember	John Eisenhart	Present
Boardmember	David Marshall	Present
Boardmember	Delores McNeely	Present

Boardmember Abel Silvas Present (left at 10:55 a.m.)

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Jacqueline Dominguez, Interim Board Secretary

Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner

Tricia Olsen, Intern

Garry Papers, Deputy Director, Urban Form

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Marianne Greene, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1A - MINUTES OF JULY 26, 2007

Boardmember Berge moved to approve the Minutes of July 26, 2007 as written. Marianne Greene, Deputy City Attorney said on page 3, bottom on the page, add the word "adopt" to the discussion on historical resources, so that the phase reads "adopt historical resources survey". Mr. Eisenhart corrected the discussion on page 15 to read "Boardmembers Berge and Eisenhart agreed that the pergola helps the home."

Motion By: Berge Second: Eisenhart Vote: 6-0-1(Silvas)

ITEM 1B - MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 27, 2007

The Minutes of September 27, 2007 were not available for approval.

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

Bruce Coons from Save Our Heritage Organisation (SOHO) provided a quick overview of recent fire damage showing before and after fire photos. Most of the structures damaged within the City are located in the San Pasqual Valley.

Wayne Donaldson, State Historic Preservation Officer, addressed the recent fire damage and resources available to the City for restoration and stabilization. The State is in support of local jurisdictions conducting surveys of back country areas to identify resources prior to another fire or other natural disasters. State will give preference for CLG Grants for survey of resources in harms way from natural disasters.

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

• Absences:

Boardmember Burnett notified staff that she would not be available for this meeting due to a work conflict and Boardmember Silvas notified staff that he must leave the meeting at 11:00am.

• Other General Information:

Contents of "Blue Folders" were copies of emails received on Item #5 from the La Jolla Historical Society and from Clint Linton, a letter on Item #6 from a Burlingame homeowner who wants their property classified as 6L rather than 6Z, and an email from Robert Mosher regarding the name for the house on Item #12.

• General Board Member Comments:

Mr. Marshall thanked Mr. Coons and Mr. Donaldson for their follow up on the fire and the information provided on the SOHO website. Natural disasters, particularly fires, cause more damage to historic buildings than other sources of demolition and destruction. Mr. Emme noted the sad and untimely passing of Beth Montes, an active and respected historic consultant and SOHO President.

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

• Conflict of Interest:

Boardmember Berge recused from Item #15 as she owns property within 500 feet of the building. Vice Chairperson Schaefer recused from Item 5. His firm has been consulting with the applicant on that project. Boardmember Marshall identified that his firm was involved in the San Diego Modernism Context Statement, Information Item #3E. There is no action necessary from the Board on this item.

• Ex Parte Communications:

None

Historical Resources Board Minutes of November 8, 2007 Page 3 of 16

> Failure to visit designation sites (including interiors proposed for designation)/invocation of waiver:

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- The General Plan Update is being heard by the Planning Commission today. Last week the Department presented the information and the commission took public testimony. Today they will be deliberating and making a recommendation to the City Council on the General Plan and the Program EIR.
- Next DAS meeting will be held on Wednesday, December 5, 2007
- The November Policy and Archaeology Subcommittee meetings normally scheduled for Monday, November 12th are cancelled due to staffing constraints. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, January 14, 2008. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will also be on Monday, January 14, 2008.

Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes four referrals from Development Services, seven individual homeowner nominations, an amendment to the Burlingame historic district, and a National Register nomination. There remain 32 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2006 waiting to be reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

I want to thank the Boardmembers and the public for your patience as we rescheduled the October meeting to today due to the devastating fires that swept through the county. I would also like to thank Mike Tudury for returning today. As you know, Mike has retired from service to the City, but agreed to attend today's meeting. We will be congratulating him with a small send off at lunch following the meeting.

Myra Herrmann, DSD, gave a quick report on the archaeological sites affected by the fires; they will be working with SHPO to determine damages. She will come back in December or January with additional information. Chair Emme asked if they knew how many sites were affected, and Ms. Herrmann responded that they were not sure.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

None

E. INFORMATION ITEMS

San Diego Modernism Historic Context Statement (No Action of the Board is required on this item.) **Staff Report by Kelley Saunders**

Angeles Leira commented that the context statement by AIA is a broader general statement of the context of Modernism, span of time is much broader than from 1935-1960, she would like to work with Staff on this project. Cathy Winterrowd stated that Staff would be happy to work with Ms. Leira and the committee and will schedule follow-up meetings.

Boardmember Schaefer hopes that this will be included in the Boardmember Handbook for all new Boardmembers.

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

The following items are non-controversial, with all parties agreeable to the staff recommendation, and the Board may wish to approve them on consent:

- ITEM 8 WILLIAM AND JENNIE DAVIS HOUSE at 1504 Grove Street
- ITEM 10 -- LEON BEATTY SPEC HOUSE #1 at 307 La Canada
- ITEM 11 DAVID E. AND JENNIE MCCRACKEN HOUSE at 3694 Pershing Avenue
- ITEM 12 LOUIS AND BERTHA FELLER/HOMER DELAWIE AND LLOYD RUOCCO HOUSE at 3377 Charles Street
- ITEM 13 -- HOMER DELAWIE HOUSE at 2749 Azalea Drive
- ITEM 14 -- DONALD AND MARY RODIBAUGH/THOMAS SHEPHERD HOUSE at 6202 Waverly Avenue
- ITEM 15 -- WILLIAM F. AND LETA B. GERNANDT HOUSE at 5002 Canterbury Drive
- ITEM 16 -- CASSUIS AND KATE PECK/THOMAS SHEPHERD HOUSE at 620 Via del Norte
- ITEM 17 -- THOMAS AND EDITH HUNTER HOUSE at 2929 Front Street

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge would like to discuss 8, 12, 13, 14, and 16

Boardmember Marshall would also like more information on 14

Boardmember Berge wanted to know if the recommendation from DAS for Item #8 is going to be a condition of a Mills Act. Ms. Winterrowd state that Staff was recommending that the property be designated as it is today and that it could be a possible condition of the Mills Act, but Staff was not recommending that. It also should be noted that the owners went to DAS and are following their recommendations, work is already underway.

Chair Emme has some concerns with the work being done on Item #10, Bonnie Adams, owner, responded that they are restoring the roof with the original wood shake singles, but didn't pass inspection because only designated houses can use wood shake shingles. Inspection is on hold, and roof cannot be completed until home is designated. They are also replacing the copper attic vent in the front, just one; the others will be placed in the back of the home.

Boardmember Marshall in regards to Item #17, that the shutters on the front of the house (public right-a-way) be removed as a condition of Mills Act. Owners agree to condition.

Boardmember Berge would like to rename Item #13 the Delawie Residence III. Chair Emme requested attorney opinion on designated a house that is out of view. City Attorney Marianne Greene stated that the city attorney issued an opinion from 2006 saying you can designate when a residence is out of view. Boardmember Schaefer mentioned that there is a document from the City Council that says you can designation, but may not be appropriate for a Mills Act agreement.

Items 12, 14, 16 pulled from consent.

Boardmember Berge recused herself from Item #15.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of November 8, 2007 Page 5 of 16

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SILVAS TO DESIGNATE CONSENT ITEMS 8, 10, 11, 13, 15, AND 17 PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION, MOTION PASSES

Motion By: Silvas Second: McNeely Vote Items #8,10,11,13, 17: 7-0-0

Vote Item #15: 6-0-1(Berge)

Would the owners of the sites that were just now designated like to address the Board?

Tara Rangarajan, owner of Item #15, wanted to thank the Board for designating their house, they are very proud to be living in the home.

Chair Emme wanted to thank Homer Delawie for coming to the meeting today.

Elizabeth Kohzina, owner of Item # 8, thanked the board for the designation, they are planning to put the window back in the front, so the original three windows will be there again, she also appreciates that the Board liked the tree.

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 — WILLIAM BLACK HOUSE/SDM-W-12 LOCUS A (SDI-4669) NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATION

Applicant: La Jolla Historical Society, not the property owner

Location: Address Restricted, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

<u>Description</u>: Review the nomination of the William Harmon Black – William Lumpkins House/SDM-W-12 Locus A (SDI-4669) for listing on the National Register and provide comments to the Office of Historic Preservation.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Review and comment on the nomination of the William Harmon Black – William Lumpkins House/SDM-W-12 Locus A (SDI-4669) for listing on the National Register of Historic Places.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Provide comments in support of listing the William Harmon Black – William Lumpkins House/SDM-W-12 Locus A (SDI-4669) on the National Register of Historic Places.

Report Number: HRB-07-075 and HRB-07-036

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd

In Favor: Don Schmidt, Angeles Leira, and Richard Carrico (organized presentation)

Pat Dahlberg; Bruce Coons; Ron May; Roger P. Craig; Carmen Lucas; Milton

Phegley; Sherri Lightner; Courtney Coyle

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Schaefer recused himself.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of November 8, 2007 Page 6 of 16

Boardmember Marshal wanted to clarify that this was a majority vote only. Ms. Winterrowd confirmed that it is. Boardmember Marshall is strongly in favor of supporting this site for the National Register of Historic Places.

Boardmember Berge also supports this site for the National Register of Historic Places, for both the site and the building.

Boardmember Eisenhart is in favor of Criterion A, feels that this is a profound site. Is still on the fence with regards to Criterion C; it is an estate home and should be judged by a higher criteria than a single family residence, craftsmanship is not outstanding, overall feel of the building not consistent with Pueblo architecture, and the additions detract from the original design.

Boardmember Silvas concerned with Criterion C on the architect for being a New Mexico Pueblo Style Adobe, which didn't last too long here in the San Diego area, this is more of an Old Town Adobe Vernacular home. As for Criteria A, proud to be on this Board that gets to vote on this site, educate the public as to what this site is, this site has everything you want.

Boardmember McNeely agrees that this is an important site and supports this site for the National Register of Historic Places.

Chair Emme questioned the lack of attendance of the Kumeyaay, asked why they are not apart of this procedure. Ms. Coyle responded that the local tribes are in favor of this nomination. Ms. Lucas stated that they are not here because they have to earn a living and she is here as a representative for the Indian community, and they love their history. Don't ignore the Indian community; this is a very sacred issue for them. Chair Emme also questioned why the East county tribes were not included in this report, and is it normal not to have any more recent digs than from 80 years ago. Boardmember Silvas answered that that was normal. Chair Emme then asked how you determine whether to rank the site on a national or local level. Boardmember Silvas responded that they all should be on a national level. Chair Emme will support the nomination.

Boardmember Marshall made the motion to support Staff recommendation. Boardmember Eisenhart asked if the Board could separate the motion by criterion. Both Chair Emme and Boardmember Marshall stated that it is an all or nothing proposition. Boardmember Eisenhart wanted to make sure his concerns were on the record. Boardmember Berge seconded the motion.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHAL TO SUPPORT STAFF RECOMMENDATION FOR ITEM 5; WILLIAM BLACK HOUSE/SDM-W-12 LOCUS A (SDI-4669) NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATION, MOTION PASSES

Motion By: Marshall Second: Berge Vote: 6-0-1(Schaefer)

Historical Resources Board Minutes of November 8, 2007 Page 7 of 16

<u>Applicant</u>: City of San Diego City Planning & Community Investment, Historical Resources Section <u>Location</u>: Various addresses within the intensive survey area (existing Burlingame Historic District boundaries), defined by the properties extending along San Marcos Street to the north, Kalmia Street to the south, 32nd Street to the east, and 30th Street to the west.

<u>Description:</u> Second hearing to consider the proposed district amendment to change the Burlingame Historical District type from a Voluntary/Traditional Historical District to a Geographic/Traditional Historical District.

Today's Action: Review the proposed amendment to the existing Burlingame Historical District to change the district type from a Voluntary/Traditional Historical District to a Geographic/Traditional Historical District; take public testimony; classify of all remaining contributing and non-contributing resources; and amend the district as a Geographic/Traditional Historical District consistent with adopted HRB Policy 4.1 and Land Development Code (LDC) Section 123.0205.

Staff Recommendation:

- 1. Approve the proposed district amendment to change the district type from a Voluntary/Traditional Historical District to a Geographic/Traditional Historical District, based on adopted HRB District Policy 4.1 and consistent with LDC Section 123.0205.
- 2. Classify the following 15 properties as Contributing Resources:

APN#	Street No.	Street Name	Status Code	Board Action
539-032-09	2408	Capitan Avenue	5D1	n/a
539-041-11	2406	Dulzura Avenue	5D1	n/a
539-044-08	3171	Kalmia Street	5B	n/a
453-711-06	3010	Laurel Street	5D1	n/a
453-711-07	3016	Laurel Street	5B	n/a
453-711-08	3024	Laurel Street	5B	n/a
453-713-22	3030	Laurel Street	5D1	n/a
539-032-01	3031	Laurel Street	5D1	n/a
453-713-14	3134	Maple Street	5D1	n/a
453-722-13	3178	Maple Street	5D1	8/23/2007
539-031-05	2404	San Marcos Ave	5B	n/a
539-031-07	2424	San Marcos Ave	5D1	n/a
539-032-03	2455	San Marcos Ave	5D1	n/a
453-722-03	2625	San Marcos Ave	5D1	n/a
453-722-06	2653	San Marcos Ave	5D1	n/a

3. Classify the following 26 properties as Non-Contributing Resources:

			Status	
APN#	Street No.	Street Name	Code	Board Action
539-043-08	2404	32nd Street	6L	n/a
539-042-07	2405	Dulzura Avenue	6L	7/26/2007
539-033-04	3025	Kalmia Street	6L	n/a
539-033-05	3031	Kalmia Street	6Z	n/a
539-033-09	3061	Kalmia Street	6L	7/26/2007
539-044-09	3183	Kalmia Street	6Z	n/a
453-724-12	3106	Laurel Street	6Z	n/a
453-724-09	3124	Laurel Street	6L	1/25/2007
453-723-05	3176	Laurel Street	6Z	n/a
453-713-15	3124	Maple Street	6L	n/a
453-724-01	3127	Maple Street	6L	n/a
453-713-13	3144	Maple Street	6L	n/a
453-722-18	3150	Maple Street	6Z	DEMO
453-724-04	3161	Maple Street	6Z	n/a
453-723-01	3175	Maple Street	6L	1/26/2006
453-723-03	3185	Maple Street	6L	n/a
453-722-11	3190	Maple Street	6Z	n/a
539-032-05	2433	San Marcos Ave	6L	1/25/2007
453-711-24	2532	San Marcos Ave	6Z	n/a
453-721-01	2602	San Marcos Ave	6Z	n/a
453-721-04	2624	San Marcos Ave	6L	n/a
453-721-05	2632	San Marcos Ave	6Z	n/a
453-721-07	2654	San Marcos Ave	6Z	n/a
453-721-08	2660	San Marcos Ave	6Z	n/a
453-721-09	2672	San Marcos Ave	6Z	n/a
453-721-10	2680	San Marcos Ave	6Z	n/a

Report Number: HRB-07-076

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd

Board Discussion:

Nancy Tarbel, owner of 3106 Laurel Street, requests a continuance until the November 29 meeting due to items being heard out of order and lack of time for today's meeting.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO CONTINOE ITEM UNTIL THE NOVEMBER 29, 2008 MEETING, MOTION PASSES

Motion By: Berge Second: Eisenhart Vote: 6-0-0

Historical Resources Board Minutes of November 8, 2007 Page 9 of 16

ITEM 7 — THE WILLIAM SHANKS APARTMENT COURTYARD

<u>Applicant</u>: Ben Badiee, Badiee Development, prospective owner (Referred from the City of San Diego Development Services Department)

Location: 104-118 Dickinson Street, Uptown Community, Council District 3

<u>Description:</u> Consider the designation of The William Shanks Apartment Courtyard located at 104-118 Dickinson Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate The William Shanks Apartment Courtyard as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Streamline Modern architecture expressed in the apartment courtyard building type.

Report Number: HRB-07-077

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Matt Peterson; Scott Moomjian; John Lyon; Ben Badee; Philip Buckley; Rob

Miller

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Eisenhart would like to add Criterion A, Courtyard Housing, for its architecture and social development it really promotes a communal way of living that was crucial in the development of neighborhoods in San Diego, this is more of a Minimal Traditional, but will support Criterion C

Boardmember Berger will also support adding Criterion A as a Special Element of courtyard living in the Uptown area. This site is also identified in the Draft Uptown Survey as 5S3, which gives it more background to applicability to support Criterion A. She also agrees that this is more of a Minimal Traditional rather than Streamline Modern

Boardmember Marshall questioned whether or not this site falls under Criterion A, since it was not really evaluated as such, leaning towards supporting Criterion C, agrees that it is more Minimal Traditional with Streamline Modern influences.

Boardmember Schaefer reiterated to the consults that the Board evaluates on Criterion only and not on future projects, land use, etc, does not feel that this site is a particularly good example of Courtyard Apartments; there are many other better examples in San Diego County. Also agrees that it is not a good Streamline Modern, there are some token elements, but there are better examples, and will not support Staff recommendation.

Boardmember McNeely is on the fence, and not in favor of Staff recommendation

Boardmember Emme also has problems with the visibility, access, and setting of this site, it is not a finite resource; there are better examples in the City.

Boardmember Eisenhart wanted to reiterate that Bungalow Courtyards are no longer being built; the setting complex has remained unchanged, and most importantly is the social interaction of people, this is a socially significant housing product of a time and place that needs to be protected throughout the City.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of November 8, 2007 Page 10 of 16

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER EISENHART TO DESIGNATE UNDER CRITERION C, AS A GOOD EXAMPLE OF STREAMLINE MODERN AND MINIMAL TRADITIONAL ARCHITECTURE, AND ALSO UNDER CRITERION A, AS A UNIQUE RESOURCE IN THE CITY UNDER ARCHITECTURE AND SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT, MOTION FAILS

Motion By: Eisenhart Second: Berge Vote: 2-4(Schaefer, McNeely, Emme, Marshall) -0

ITEM 8 — WILLIAM AND JENNIE DAVIS HOUSE

<u>Applicant</u>: Christianne Knoop and Beth Montes on behalf of the owners, Thomas and Elizabeth Kohzina (Referred from the City of San Diego Development Services Department)

Location: 1504 Grove Street, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

<u>Description:</u> Consider the designation of the William and Jennie Davis House located at 1504 Grove Street, as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the William and Jennie Davis House located at 1504 Grove Street, as a historical resource based on HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of Craftsman style architecture.

Report Number: HRB-07-078

Staff Report by Mike Tudury

BOARD ACTION:

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 9 — 484 SAN ELIJO STREET

<u>Applicant</u>: Kathleen Crawford on behalf of the owners, Eric and Lynn Allen (Referred from the City of San Diego Development Services Department)

Location: 484 San Elijo Street, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

<u>Description:</u> Consider the designation of the property at 484 San Elijo Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Do not designate the property at 484 San Elijo Street as a historical resource under any HRB criteria.

Report Number: HRB-07-079

Staff Report by Mike Tudury

In Favor: Scott Moomjian and Larry Pappas (organized presentation)

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Marshal wanted confirmation that the cladding was wood, as stated the report, or asbestos shingle. Mr. Moomjian confirmed that is was asbestos shingles, not wood.

Boardmember Marshall agrees with Staff recommendation, because of the cladding issue and the report needs to be changed from wood to asbestos shingles

Boardmember Eisenhart supporting Staff recommendation, relation of parts and proportions don't add up

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER EISENHART TO NOT DESIGNATE PROPERTY, PER STAFF RECCOMENDATION, MOTION PASSES

Motion By: Eisenhart Second: McNeely Vote: 6-0-0

ITEM 10 -- LEON BEATTY SPEC HOUSE #1

<u>Applicant</u>: Vonn Marie May on behalf of owners, Dennis and Bonnie Adams (Referred from the City of San Diego Development Services Department)

Location: 307 La Canada, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

<u>Description:</u> Consider the designation of the Leon Beatty Spec House #1, located at 307 La Canada, as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Leon Beatty Spec House #1, located at 307 La Canada, as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Ranch architecture with French Revival influences.

Report Number: HRB-07-080

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

BOARD ACTION:

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 11 – DAVID E. AND JENNIE MCCRACKEN HOUSE

Applicant: Ruth Alter, Archaeos on behalf of Ron Oster, owner

Location: 3694 Pershing Avenue, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

<u>Description:</u> Consider the designation of the David E. and Jennie McCracken House, located at 3694 Pershing Avenue, as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the David E. and Jennie McCracken House, located at 3694
Pershing Avenue in North Park, as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as a
unique example of Spanish/Mission Eclectic with Craftsman influenced architecture
constructed of red brick on a cobble-studded concrete foundation, and retaining a good
level of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-07-081

Historical Resources Board Minutes of November 8, 2007 Page 12 of 16

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd

BOARD ACTION:

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 12 – LOUIS AND BERTHA FELLER/HOMER DELAWIE AND LLOYD RUOCCO HOUSE

Applicant: Kathleen Crawford and Marie Burke Lia, on behalf of Andre Lusti, owner

Location: 3377 Charles Street, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

<u>Description:</u> Consider the designation of the Louis and Bertha Feller/Homer Delawie and Lloyd Ruocco House, located at 3377 Charles Street, as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Louis and Bertha Feller/Homer Delawie and Lloyd Ruocco House, located at 3377 Charles Street, as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of the Modern style and under Criterion D as the work of Master Architects Homer Delawie and Lloyd Ruocco.

Report Number: HRB-07-082

Staff Report by Ginger Weatherford

In Favor: Carolyn Kutzke, previous owner

Scott Moomjian

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmembers Berge and Emme both had concerns about alterations made to the site. Staff responded that given the modification to the site they didn't feel that they detracted from the integrity of the site. Ms. Kutzke, previous owner, worked with Homer Delawie on all of the modifications and restoration of the site.

Boardmember Schaefer wanted clarification on who was the actual architect on the house. Homer Delawie answered that Lloyd Ruocco was his mentor, partner and friend, but he had nothing to do the architecture of this house.

Boardmember Eisenhart feels that both partners should be named, and would like to set criteria to address this situation in the future. Is Ruocco's stamp on the plans? He is in favor of Staff recommendation for the name and site. Mr. Moomjian responded that the plans were not stamped.

Boardmember Marshall is in favor of revised name

Boardmember Schaefer is in favor of designation, believes this to be an archetypal for style, and the primary record needs to be updated to show all of the restoration and alterations to the home.

Boardmembers Berge agrees with Boardmember Schaefer, it is important to note that the original architect was involved in the restoration and alterations to the home.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of November 8, 2007 Page 13 of 16

Chair Emme feels that the Staff report is not complete and that maybe this Item should be continued until all of the complete information is available to the Board. Ms. Winterrowd responded the Boards action can include testimony and information received today, the Board can also continue the item if more information is needed.

Boardmember McNeely noted that the information is in the report, it is not overwhelming, but she will be using the report and the testimony today to make her decision.

Boardmembers Berge feels that the information in the reports needs to be clarified. Mr. Moomjian agreed to make the changes to clarify the information in the DPR.

Boardmember Marshall is concerned that for the motion to pass, they need 6 votes, and that without Boardmember Silvas they only have 6 people. Would like the Chair to poll the other Boardmembers on their votes, or table the Item for a future meeting when they have more than 6 people present. Both Boardmember Berge, with clarification, and Boardmember Schafer will support designation. Chair Emme will not support due to lack information and photos. Boardmember Marshall then would like to make a motion to continue the item, rather than not designate. Mr. Moomjian will speak with Ms. Lia and is in support of the continuance if there is not sufficient support for designation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR EMME THAT THE APPLICANT AND THEIR CONSULTANT PROVIDE STAFF WITHIN 60 DAYS MORE INFORMATION INCLUDING: PHOTOGRAPHS, PLANS (WITH THE STATE STAMP), DRAWINGS AND ANY ADDITIONS INFORMATION TO COMPLETE THE FILE. MOTION PASSES

Motion By: Emme	Second: Berge	Vote: 6-0-0
------------------------	---------------	-------------

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHAL TO SUPPORT DESIGNATION OF ITEM 12 UNDER CRITERION C AND D, PER STAFF RECOMENDATION

Motion By: Marshall Second: Emme Vote: 6-0-0

Separate motion to rename the property

BOARD DISCUSSION:

Boardmember Eisenhart suggested renaming the house Homer Delawie of Ruocco Delawie Architects – to give some recognition to Ruocco. Mr. Coons and Ms. Kutzke both argued that it should be named after Homer Delawie only, Ruocco should not be included in the name. Boardmember Berge reviewed the naming policy and concluded that it makes more sense to name it after the known architect who designed and built the home. Mr. Lusti, present owner of

Historical Resources Board Minutes of November 8, 2007 Page 14 of 16

the home, asked if this would have been an issue if it was a less known architect, instead of Ruocco. Boardmember Eisenhart responded that it still would be an issue of continuity, and by having Ruocco's name on the property it does take credit away from Homer Delawie.

Boardmember Marshal asked if this motion needed a majority vote or if it needed the full 6 votes to pass. Ms. Winterrowd replied that this was a majority vote, only designations required the 6 votes. Mr. Marshall made the motion to change the name.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHAL TO RENAME THE HOUSE LOUIS AND BERTHA FELLER/HOMER DELAWIE HOUSE AND REMOVE LLOYD RUOCCO FROM CRITERION D, MOTION PASSES

Motion By: Marshall Second: Berge Vote: 5-1(Eisenhart)-0

ITEM 13 – HOMER DELAWIE HOUSE

Applicant: Tricia Olsen, on behalf of Homer Delawie, owner

Location: 2749 Azalea Drive, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

<u>Description:</u> Consider the designation of the Homer Delawie House, located at 2749 Azalea Drive, as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Homer Delawie House, located at 2749 Azalea Drive, as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of the Modern style and under Criterion D as the work of Master Architect Homer Delawie.

Report Number: HRB-07-083

Staff Report by Ginger Weatherford

BOARD ACTION:

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 14 – DONALD AND MARY RODIBAUGH/THOMAS SHEPHERD HOUSE

Applicant: Vonn Marie May on behalf of the owners, Stephen and Claudia Metcalf

Location: 6206 Waverly Avenue, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

<u>Description:</u> Consider the designation of the Donald and Mary Rodibaugh/Thomas Shepherd House as a Historical Resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the 1947 Donald and Mary Rodibaugh/Thomas Shepherd House, located at 6202 Waverly Avenue in La Jolla, under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of early Ranch style architecture and under Criterion D, associated with Master Architect Thomas Shepherd.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of November 8, 2007 Page 15 of 16

Report Number: HRB-07-084 Staff Report by Mike Tudury

In Favor: Von Marie May; Claudia Metcalf

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Marshall has concerns with the scale of the addition above the garage and the extreme visibility from the street, elevation of the garage has been changed dramatically. If these plans were brought before DAS, it would have been denied because it does not meet the standards. He will not be supporting designation

Boardmember Berge agrees with Boardmember Marshall that there is a dramatic change and will not be supporting designation

Owner requested Item be continued until November 29, 2007

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO GRANT A CONTINUENCE UNTIL NOVEMBER 29, 2008, PER OWNERS REQUEST, MOTION PASSES

Motion By: Berge Second: McNeely Vote: 6-0-0

ITEM 15 – WILIAM F. AND LETA B. GERNANDT HOUSE

Applicant: Ronald V. May, RPA of Legacy 106, Inc. on behalf of Suresha and Tara Rangarajan, owners

Location: 5002 Canterbury Drive, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 3

<u>Description:</u> Consider the designation of the William F. and Leta B. Gernandt House, located at 5002 Canterbury Drive, as a Historical Resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the William F. and Leta B. Gernandt House, located at 5002 Canterbury Drive in Kensington, as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C, as an excellent example of 1926 Spanish Eclectic architecture retaining a good level of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-07-085

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd

BOARD ACTION:

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

Historical Resources Board Minutes of November 8, 2007 Page 16 of 16

ITEM 16 - CASSUIS AND KATE PECK/THOMAS SHEPHERD HOUSE

<u>Applicant</u>: Vonn Marie May on behalf of the owner, Delores Coyner Location: 620 Via del Norte, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

<u>Description:</u> Consider the designation of the Cassuis and Kate Peck/Thomas Shepherd House as a Historical Resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Cassuis and Kate Peck/Thomas Shepherd House, located at 620 Via del Norte in La Jolla, under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of Ranch style architecture and under Criterion D, associated with Master Architect Thomas Shepherd.

Report Number: HRB-07-086

Staff Report by Mike Tudury

Board Discussion:

Due to time constraints Item #16 is trailed to November 29, 2007.

ITEM 17 – THOMAS AND EDITH HUNTER HOUSE

Applicant: Scott Moomjian on behalf of the owners, Douglas and Kristie Buckley

Location: 2929 Front Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2

<u>Description:</u> Consider the designation of the Thomas and Edith Hunter House located at 2929 Front Street, as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Thomas and Edith Hunter House located at 2929 Front Street, as a historical resource based on HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of Arts and Crafts style architecture, with Prairie influences.

Report Number: HRB-07-087

Staff Report by Mike Tudury

BOARD ACTION:

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: November 29, 2007

LOCATION: City Administration Building

12th Floor, Council Committee Room

ADJOURNED AT 12:14 PM